

Historic Preservation Commission

CITY OF LEBANON HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Regular Meeting – January 14, 2020

ATTENDEES

John Foutch
Wayne Oakley

Marilyn Bryant

Paul Stumb

Greg Dugdale

Seth Harrison

Kathleen Vail

Matt Schenk

CALL TO ORDER

Staff called the meeting to order at 5:00 PM.

ELECTION OF OFFICERS

1. Chairman

A motion was made by Marilyn Bryant and seconded by Greg Dugdale to elect John Foutch as Chairman. Motion carried.

2. Vice Chairman

A motion was made by John Foutch and seconded by Greg Dugdale to elect Kathy Adams as Vice Chairman. Motion carried.

3. Secretary

A motion was made by Greg Dugdale and seconded by Wayne Oakley to elect Staff as Secretary. Motion carried.

Commissioner Paul Stumb arrived late.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Marilyn Bryant and seconded by Greg Dugdale to approve the Regular Called December 10, 2019 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting. Motion carried.

NEW BUSINESS

1. Case 20-1 Request by Sterling Buster for a Certificate of Appropriateness for work being done at 140 Public Square (Tax Map 68E Group P Parcel 19) zoned CD in Ward 3

Historic Preservation Commission

Staff said that all wood windows should be repaired if possible, rather than replaced. If windows must be replaced, rather than repaired, Staff is not opposed to the windows if architectural features including scale, design finish, texture, durability, and detailing to historic material are maintained. Staff recommended approval of replacement anodized aluminum windows for all windows that are not wood sash and if the original window configuration remains identical.

Applicant Sterling Buster brought a sample of the type of vinyl windows that he was proposing. He said that the wood windows have been there 40 years and were beyond repair. He noted that all the neighboring buildings have new windows and his would be the same style. He said that he wants to have the windows in standard black and paint the building black and keep the limestones the same to make it pop.

A motion was made by Greg Dugdale and seconded by Paul Stumb to accept the proposal subject to Staff's comments. Motion carried 5-0.

Commissioner Wayne Oakley asked about the ventilation and insulated glazed window units.

Applicant Sterling Buster said that he is planning on removing the ventilation and noted that the roofing will also be replaced in kind with a tarred roof.

Staff noted that historically, the applicant does not have to follow the energy standards because of the building.

A motion was made to modify the previous motion to accept vinyl subject to all windows. Paul Stumb seconded, and motion carried. 5-0.

Staff advised the applicant that the roof would be reviewed at staff level and that paint color is not under review by the commission.

2. Case 20-2 Show Cause Hearing regarding work being done by owner Hollis McClanahan at 112 Public Square (Tax Map 68E Group O Parcel 26) zoned CD in Ward 3

Staff was notified that work to brick up window openings at 112 Public Square was being carried out without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Window openings altered were located on the West side of the building. Staff issued a stop work order and delivered an application for a COA November 19th, 2019. No application has been turned in, though an attorney has contacted Staff regarding this hearing. Owner was notified in mail as to the show cause December 9, 2019.

Attorney Jonathan Tinsley represented the owner, Mrs. McClanahan. He stated that the windows had been boarded up since 1983. He said that the view of the building is mostly from Burger King. He said that they would like to propose bricking up two more windows and keeping the ones that are already bricked. The interior walls were already built and blocked those windows and the chimney blocked two others. He proposed restoring the two windows and the one near the rear. He felt that restoring the door would create a safety issue.

Historic Preservation Commission

Commissioner Wayne Oakley said that his statement on the visibility from only Burger King is a not a relevant comment. He observed that the brickwork is shoddy, wavy, it does not match the brickwork that is there and is very noticeable.

There was further discussion over hardship, the guidelines, and painting.

Commissioner Greg Dugdale mentioned that the regulations require the replacement of the boards back over the windows and the building has looked bad and looks marginally better. He asked if they would consider a paint job.

Commissioner Oakley said that he is not agreeable to what is there with the brown and red bricks and the brickwork was not done by a mason.

There was further discussion.

A motion was made by Greg Dugdale to defer and subject to an acceptable plan submitted to Staff and accept the sketch.

Staff asked about the Coca-Cola sign.

Staff explained the ghost sign regulations.

Commissioner Dugdale explained that his motion was to defer and approve the sketch subject to an acceptable plan submitted to Staff.

Staff noted that this is a show cause hearing.

A motion was made by Paul Stumb and seconded by Marilyn Bryant to submit a Certificate of Appropriateness regarding the plan, the painting, the ghost sign that is acceptable to Staff. Motion carried 5-0.

Discussion on the murals that were proposed for the Square area.

3. Case 20-3 Show Cause Hearing regarding work being done by Herman Odum at 132 South Hatton Avenue (Tax Map 68F Group D Parcel 14) zoned RD9 in Ward 3

Staff was notified that work to remove a window, install a new door, and install a new pathway at 132 South Hatton Avenue was being carried out without a Certificate of Appropriateness. The window removal and door installation occurred on the South side of the home, and the pathway was installed on the East and South sides of the home. Staff did not issue a stop work order due to work already having been completed by the time Staff became aware of the alterations. No application has been turned in to Staff, and no effort to contact Staff has been made. Owner was notified in mail regarding the show cause December 9, 2019.

Historic Preservation Commission

Mr. Salazar spoke on behalf of owner Herman Odum said that he has lived there for 10 years and remodeled 12 houses on Gay Street and South Hatton Avenue and never received a stop work order. He also said that he never received a letter and that his house is an aluminum house not from the 1800s. Upon questioning from the Commission, Mr. Salazar said he did receive the December letter from staff but was unsure how to contact them. The house is wood and the old framing from a door was there, so they removed the window and put in a door because he said the window was unsafe. He finished by stating that he did not know that he was in a historic district.

There was a discussion regarding his notice and the post office delivery of letters.

A motion was made by Greg Dugdale and seconded by Paul Stumb to allow the owner to file a Certificate of Appropriateness. Motion carried 5-0.

DISCUSSION

1. Fences in the Non-residential Historic Preservation Guidelines

Staff brought the issue with the fencing before the commission and it was decided to write an amendment stating approved fencing types, and how they should be installed. The amendment to the Historic Guidelines will be brought before the commission at the next meeting.

PLANNING COMMENTS

Staff mentioned that there should be a new member appointed soon.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

The commission brought forth the possibility of mailing property owners a reminder.

The commission asked that Staff provide examples of historic signage.

ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at 6:04 PM.

Vice-Chairperson Kathy Adams Date 2/12/2020
~~John Foutch~~ Kathy Adams
Recording Secretary, Kathleen Vail Date 2/12/2020
Recording Secretary, Kathleen Vail